

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE TRANSPORT SCRUTINY
COMMITTEE HELD ON THURSDAY 10 MARCH 2022 IN COMMITTEE
ROOM 1, WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET,
LEEDS, LS1 2DE**

Present:

Councillor Amanda Parsons-Hulse (Chair)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Peter Caffrey (Deputy)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Harry Ellis	Wakefield Council
Councillor Peter Clarke	Bradford Council
Councillor Jackie Ferguson	Wakefield Council
Councillor Dot Foster	Calderdale Council
Councillor Sharon Hamilton	Leeds City Council
Councillor Nic Stansby	Wakefield Council
Councillor Ruth Wood	Bradford Council
Councillor Paul Wray	Leeds City Council
Councillor Yusra Hussain	Kirklees Council
Councillor Donald Firth	Kirklees Council
Councillor Mohsin Hussain	Bradford Council
Councillor Andrew Pinnock (Substitute)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Andrew Hollyer (Substitute)	York City Council

In attendance:

Khaled Berroum	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Katie Edmondson (Minute 10 only)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
James Nutter (Minute 9 only)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Dave Pearson	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Hannah Scales	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Anthony Smith and Stephen Fenton, with Councillors Andrew Pinnock and Andrew Hollyer substituting.

The meeting was confirmed as quorate, with 15 members present out of 11 needed for quorum.

2. Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

There were no declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests.

3. Possible exclusion of the press and public

There were no items requiring the exclusion of the press and public.

4. Minutes of the meeting held on 18 November 2021

Resolved: That the minutes of the meeting held on 18 November 2021 be approved.

5. Notes of the last informal meeting held on 20 January 2022

Resolved: That the notes of the inquorate meeting held on 20 January 2022 be noted and entered as public record of what was discussed.

6. Chair's update and comments

The Committee received a verbal update from the Chair. The Chair and Deputy Chair had met with Cllr Susan Hinchcliffe (Chair of Transport Committee) and discussed current challenges including, but not limited to, the current rising inflation and role of Transport Committee in relation to Transport Scrutiny Committee.

Members noted the initial proposed changes to the scrutiny committee structure and plans going forward to transfer place/environment work from the Economy Scrutiny Committee remit to Transport Scrutiny Committee. The Committee also heard that a wrap-up session was due to be arranged for the end of the year to evaluate progress and performance and forward plan for the coming year.

Resolved: That the Chair's verbal update be noted.

7. Transport Committee Review

The Committee received an update on the Transport Committee Review following the Combined Authority meeting on 3 February. Members noted that the content of the report and proposed plans fell into the Corporate Scrutiny remit and any comments would be relayed to the Chair.

Members raised questions about several topics relating to the review which were answered as detailed below.

- **Allowances:** The Independent Remuneration Panel had been instructed to assess the level of allowances paid for the roles of Deputy Chair, Transport Engagement Lead and Ordinary Member. The IRP's findings were planned to be reported back to the Combined Authority at its meeting next week on 17 March 2022.
- **Allocation of members across districts:** The proposal retained the current balance of members across each Constituent Council with the addition of the transport portfolio holders from each Constituent Council as voting members of the committee and two deputy chair roles. Members learned the allocation of members on the Committee

was rolled over from current appointment (which were approximate to population when originally created).

- **Role of two Deputy Chairs:** The two Deputy Chair roles were intended to be thematic with significant workloads. The remit of each Deputy Chair would be agreed from year-to-year to secure a balance of anticipated workloads.

Resolved: That the report be noted, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.

8. **Bus Service Improvement Plan and Enhanced Partnership update**

The Committee was updated on the next steps of the Bus Service Improvement Plan (BSIP) and Bus Enhanced Partnership. Members discussed the report in detail, raised various questions and learned the below.

- **Bus Recovery Grant:** Members received an update on the Bus Recovery Grant, it was confirmed that Government had extended the funding for the coming 6 months until September. There was concern that this could result in wholesale reductions in bus services however bus patronage was hoped to recover; two bus operators had recently reported the best week in bus patronage in 2 years.
- **Enhanced Partnership:** The Enhanced Partnership was due to go to the Combined Authority to be formalised which would allow officers to work collectively with bus operators on operations and cooperate to improve reactivity to current circumstances and needs.
- **BSIP funding shortfall and financial planning:** Members discussed the significant BSIP funding shortfall and heard that while the Government encouraged ambitious bidding, the Combined Authority did not expect to receive the full £168 million. There was difficulty in planning strategically and financially when the final settlement was unknown.
- **Zero Emission Buses:** The bidding process for zero emission buses was explained; the Combined Authority jointly bid for funding with bus operators which had resulted in a focus on certain bus depots in certain districts. Only around 10% of the bus fleet would transition to zero carbon, it would be a significant project/price to roll out across the entire fleet.
- **Flexi Bus Scheme Pilot:** Members received a brief update on the Flexi Bus Pilot including lessons learned and challenges in ensuring the service is available to whole communities. The intention was to roll out the Flexi Bus in a mixed urban/rural area as part of the learning process. A fuller analysis report would be available at a later date.

- **Reliability of services:** Members discussed the effect of bus reliability on regular patronage. Reliability was a recurring issue heightened by the pandemic and reduction of services.

Resolved: That the report be noted, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.

9. Rail update

The Committee received a report relating to the latest national and regional rail restructuring. Particular aspects of the report were discussed in depth as detailed below.

- **Governance structure and model:** Members discussed the Williams-Shapps White Paper (published last summer) and expressed concern that it focussed on 'branding' rather than service provision and infrastructure. It was discussed that the purpose of the changes is to create greater accountability in a single body across infrastructure and services which has been missing under the previous arrangement to help ensure the previous rail timetable chaos doesn't happen again.
- **Ownership of rail stock:** The ownership of the rolling stock was unclear and officers would seek clarification and report back.
- **Peak and Off-peak rail fares:** Members were concerned due to the lack of clarity of the current Peak and Off-peak rail fare pricing system which seemed to penalise workers and students. Peak and Off-peak fares were introduced around six years ago to mitigate overcrowding on trains. Members heard that the commuter market continued to be lower than pre-covid but rail travel for leisure had increased significantly.
- **Zero-carbon ambitions:** Members noted that there is an in-built carbon impact from rail infrastructure and from the power supply and that rail travel is expected to grow as people return to places of work.
- **Impact of HS2:** Members discussed the impact of the HS2 plans being revisited. The decision was being analysed and next steps negotiated by the Managing Director and Mayor with the Department for Transport.
- **East-West rail links:** The importance of rail links between East-West, West Yorkshire, Yorkshire, and the Humber and North-West as opposed to further links with London was discussed. The East-West rail link was described as the Transport for the North 'showpiece' to underpin the need for greater economic activity.

Resolved: That the report be noted, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.

10. Behaviour change

The Committee considered a report on behaviour change activity related to enabling people across West Yorkshire to use sustainable transport modes delivered by the Combined Authority and its partners. The Chair also invited Cllr Jackie Ferguson to speak on the psychology of behaviour change, due to her professional background in psychology.

- **Psychology:** Members heard about various psychology studies such as 'Pavlov's Dog' and 'Bandura's Bobo Doll' and a case study utilising 'gamification' to influence behaviour. Members also discussed the application of a rewards system such as discounts, for public transport to encourage higher patronage and increase usage.
- **Young People and Education:** The importance of targeting young people was discussed, using the education system and initiatives in schools. An example of this was 'Own Our Streets' run recently in Wakefield which encouraged the use of buses or active travel to travel to and from school. With younger people becoming increasingly digitally connected, Members considered the use of apps and building a travel network based on the needs of the next generation.
- **Time:** Members thought there was a lack of emphasis on the time consumed by different modes of travel, whilst monetary price was the main major motivator/demotivator, the length of time a journey takes was also important but not usually advertised. Members discussed methods to encourage people to walk to their destination such as using signage with journey time information.
- **Motivators / Perceived Barriers:** Members discussed in detail motivators and perceived barriers for people using public transport and active travel. The importance of promoting benefits such as monetary savings and fitness as well as environmental advantages was also considered. The use of common marketing techniques was discussed in addition to utilising the new luxury branded electric two-wheelers to motivate greater use.
- **Infrastructure:** The importance of service quality and infrastructure was emphasised, prior to promotion a service it needed to be of high standard, reliable and meet key motivators to ensure people would consistently use and transition to using public transport and active modes of travel.

Resolved: That the Committee looked at behaviour change in more detail in the coming year, possibly through a working group.

11. Transport Scrutiny Work Programme

The Committee considered the Work programme for 2021/22. The Annual Report was due to be produced and short wrap-up sessions arranged for

each Scrutiny Committee. In the future it was hoped more external groups and experts would be invited to speak at Committees, particularly those from seldom heard groups.

Resolved: That the report and comments be noted.